To
The Chairman of the scientific jury,
determined by Order No. R-109-189/15.03.2023
of the Rector of Medical University" Prof. Dr. Paraskev Stoyanov"
Varna, Bulgaria

REVIEW

by Associate Professor Dr. Svetlozar Spasov Spasov, MD,PhD - Head of the Department of Forensic Medicine and Deontology of the Medical University - Plovdiv,

in connection with the procedure for the defense of a dissertation work for awarding the educational and scientific degree "Doctor" to *Dr. Diana Gocheva Gospodinova* in the scientific field of higher education

- 7. Healthcare and sports, professional direction
- 7.1. Medicine,

Medical specialty-03.01.59 "Forensic medicine" - doctoral student of an independent form of study in the Department of "General and Clinical Pathology and Forensic Medicine and Deontology" of the Medical University "Prof. Dr. Paraskev Stoyanov" Varna.

<u>With protocol No. 1 of 20.03.2023</u> from the first meeting of the scientific jury, I am appointed to prepare a review of the scientific work prepared by the candidate Dr. Diana Gocheva Gospodinova under the procedure for acquiring the educational and scientific degree "Doctor" at the Medical University- Varna.

As an attachment I present the following: Review of a dissertation work on the topic "The role of medical assistance in determining the medico-biological qualification of bodily injuries" for awarding the educational and scientific degree "Doctor" in medicine, scientific specialty: forensic medicine of Dr. Diana Gocheva Gospodinova, doctoral student of self-study at the Department of "General and Clinical Pathology, Forensic Medicine and Deontology" of the University of Varna.

Field of higher education: 7. Health care and sports.

Professional direction 7.1. Medicine.

Doctoral program in the scientific specialty **03.01.59** "Forensic Medicine" (accredited specialty by NAOA for Medical University-Varna)

I. Procedure data

Dr. Diana Gocheva Gospodinova is an assistant at the Department of "General and Clinical Pathology, Forensic Medicine and Deontology" at the University of Varna. She is enrolled in the same Department as a doctoral student of independent preparation for the acquisition of the scientific and educational degree "Doctor" in the scientific specialty "Forensic Medicine" with the enrolment order of the Rector of MU-Varna R-109-453/20.10.2021. The scientific leader of the project is Prof. Dr. William Dokov, MD.

With protocol No. 486/16.02.2023, Dr. Gospodinova was dismissed with the right of defense after a positive evaluation of her dissertation work by the academic staff of the department.

The deduction with the right of defence was carried out on the basis of the decision of the faculty council of the Faculty of Medicine, protocol No. 52/12.10.2021, on the occasion of submitted reports ent. No. 102-630823.02.2023 by Prof. Dr. Maria Angelova Tsaneva, MD and No. 102-2480/08.10.2021 by Associate Professor Dr. Deyan Lyudmilov Jenkov, MD Head of General and Clinical Pathology, Forensic Medicine and Deontology.

After decision No. 83/06.03.2023 year of FS and report with entry No. 103-1304/13.03.2023 by Prof. Zlatislav Stoyanov, MD - Dean of the Faculty of Medicine of the University of Varna, the procedure for the dismissal with the right of defense of the doctoral student Dr. Diana Gocheva Gospodinova has been finalized by order No. R-109-453/20.10.2021.

The procedures for enrolling and deducting Dr. Diana Gocheva Gospodinova as a self-study doctoral student in the Department of General and Clinical Pathology, Forensic Medicine and Deontology of the Medical University of Varna, Department of Higher Education: 7. Health and Sports.; Professional direction 7.1. Medicine.; Doctoral program in the scientific specialty 03.01.59 "Forensic Medicine" (accredited specialty by NAOA for the Medical University-Varna) was conducted in accordance with the requirements of the ZRASRB and the Regulations on the terms and conditions for acquiring scientific degrees and holding academic positions at the Medical University "Prof. Dr. Paraskev Stoyanov" Varna.

The set of materials presented by the candidate in electronic format for the preparation of a review, as well as the dissertation work and abstract in paper format, are in accordance with the requirements of the ZRASRB and the Regulations on the terms and conditions for acquiring scientific degrees and holding academic positions at a Medical University. Prof. Dr. Paraskev Stoyanov" Varna.

II. Biographical data, career development, achievements

- 1. Date of birth: 23.05.1969 in Stara Zagora
- 2. Higher education: 1988-1994 year; Master's degree, specialty "Medicine", Higher Medical Institute, Stara Zagora, 1994
- 3. Specialization 1995-2001 specialization in forensic medicine at VMI-Stara Zagora. Obtained medical specialty "Forensic Medicine"
 - 4. Positions held
 - 1996-2000 resident doctor in the Republic of Kazanlak
- 2002-2011 forensic medicine doctor and health insurance doctor at the St. Marina" EOOD, Varna
- 2011 until now specialist doctor University Hospital "St. Marina" city of Varna since 2013- assistant, 2022/2023 part-time assistant at Medical University "Prof. Dr. Paraskev Stoyanov" Varna
 - 5. Short-term specializations Bulgaria and abroad

- 6. Teaching experience Guided classes on study subjects: forensic medicine and deontology for medical and dental students
 - 9. Expert activity Expert on the list Varna District Court
- 10. Membership in organizations Bulgarian Society of Forensic Medicine Bulgarian Medical Association 11. Proficiency in foreign languages Russian intermediate level of proficiency, English basic level of proficiency.
 - 12. Computer literacy practical.

III. Opinion on dissertation work

On the topic - essence and title of the work

The problem discussed by the doctoral student is a medico-legal one, as for forensic medicine science and practice it is extremely deep and difficult. Modern forensic medical practice does not have a one-way solution to the issues of determining the medico-biolytic signs of bodily injuries, as the contradictions of the experts are legally and practically laid down in the legal framework formed by two documents - NPK and Decree No. 3/29.09.1979 of the Plenum of the Supreme Court of NRB. In addition to all the norms stated in these documents, two texts are available that are debatable among the forensic community. These are the questions of the moment of determination of the bodily injury caused and the role of the medical assistance provided to the victim in the determination of TP. As the doctoral student rightly notes, "The result is expressed in the adoption of radically contradictory opinions when choosing the medical-biological qualifying sign for bodily injury, and not a small part of them derive precisely from the limitation in the interpretation of medical intervention", i.e. for traumatic injuries similar in type and health outcome, radically different in severity and type of medico-biological signs are defined. Guidelines and opinions on the problem have been advocated by a small number of prominent forensic doctors in their monographs and articles, but they can be used only for information and not as a basis for deciding the cases, which is entirely legal. The contradiction of our opinion with the normative framework of the discussed problem will give rise to an incorrect expert opinion, if a change of the legal framework is not achieved by the lawyer, in matters where this is necessary. The adoption by the forensic medical college of rules specifying and deciding the discussed elements of the determination of bodily injuries cannot solve the problems if it is not laid down by law. The drafting of the Standard on Forensic Medicine also cannot resolve legislative issues, and the rules therein cannot be inconsistent with the aforementioned normative framework. The current dissertation work is the first attempt to research the medical assistance provided with expertise available to the doctoral student to determine TP in the region, the structuring of this assistance by types and volume, impact on the health of the victim and other aspects of the problem. This would help to objectify through scales to evaluate the medical care provided. The discussed project, after a trial application in practice, can become the basis of a discussion of the advocated issues by the forensic medical college, which will be finalized with a proposal to the legislator to specify the regulations in this part, without which the application of new practices would be illegal.

Knowledge of the subject

The literature review is presented on 71 pages, which represents 39.4% of the entire work, which represents a good relative share of this part of the scientific work. The introduction to the topic sufficiently clearly substantiates the problem and the project for its research. The literature review is complete, contains sufficient data motivating the author for the choice of topic, explains the problem, provides basic theoretical data for. Authors from the country and all over the world are represented. A serious literature database in terms of volume and quality is cited. The bibliography contains 190 correctly cited literary sources, 94 of which are in Cyrillic and 86 sources in foreign languages. The overview is complete, with good structure, layout and style. Almost all aspects relevant to the topic and subsequent research are covered. At the end of the review, a short analysis and conclusions are made, which determine the essence of the topic and the determination of its purpose.

The purpose of the dissertation is relevant to the topic and the tasks set for its achievement.

The tasks of the scientific work are relevant, well-oganized, specific, clear, precise.

The material and methods are suitable for achieving the goal and completing the tasks, as well as the overall development of the topic. The methods are reported in a volume of 13 pages/ too large a volume/, but they are well explained and for the unprepared reader their description is useful and important for evaluating the entire project.

Own research and results:

The results of the analysis are presented textually and partially graphically. They are clear, specific and correspond to the tasks and the purpose of the work. Targeted conclusions are drawn from the available database and presented in an understandable and clear manner. Formulated conclusions, recommendations, conclusion and claimed contributions are presented in separate chapters. They are clear, relevant, correct and true. I accept all stated contributions as genuine. The scientific work has a serious summarizing informational contribution, being a good theoretical-practical basis for future legislative work in the direction of what was communicated by the doctoral student Dr. Diana Gospodinova.

I have almost no critical notes. The language and style of the work follows the rules of scientific style and communicates information concisely and clearly. The information is voluminous, but the nature of the research requires it. Shortening some of the information in the literature review, without excluding important sections, would not harm the work. It is possible to extend the conclusions by developing an application for a specific algorithm of work of forensic doctors, ready for submission for regulatory approval.

IV. Evaluation of mandatory publications on the subject of dissertation work: The dissertation student presents three peer-reviewed articles:

Gospodinova D., Kaisheva E. Dokov W. Different aspects of legal assessment of healthcare provision to road accident participants. 100 rokov ustavu sudneho lekarstva - Bratislava, 215-222, 2019

Dokov W Gospodinova D.., Kaisheva E. Opportunities for objectively determining the case of death as a result of trauma or inadequate treatment. Folia Societatis Medicinae Legalis Slovacae 9 (2), 131-134, 2019

Gospodinova D., W Dokov, Kaisheva E. Analysis of the liability in case of death after mechanical injury and medical treatment. Folia Societatis Medicinae Legalis Slovacae 9 (2), 84-88, 2019

They have the necessary scientific value and present stages of the preparation of the dissertation work.

VI. Overall job rating:

The presented dissertation work of Dr. Diana Gocheva Gospodinova is in a volume of 180 pages, including 31 tables and 24 figures, 5 appendices. The bibliography contains 190 correctly cited literary sources, 94 of which are in Cyrillic and 86 sources in foreign languages. The paper is written in grammatically and stylistically sound language, structured in the legally required sections - introduction, literature review, purpose, tasks, hypotheses, research material and methodology, results, discussion, conclusions, conclusion, recommendations, contributions, bibliography, which is in accordance with the legal requirements for such work.

The discussion, conclusions, recommendations and conclusion in the dissertation work of Dr. Gospodinova fulfills the purpose and tasks and forms a relatively clear position of the author on the discussed problem, based on the obtained results. The conclusions drawn are clear, concrete and reflect the fulfillment of the topic, purpose and tasks of the dissertation work. The working hypotheses of the work have been proven.

Marked collegiate single dissertation recommendations are not essential.

All this gives me reasons to recommend to the members of the Scientific Jury to vote positively for awarding the educational and scientific degree "Doctor" in Forensic Medicine to Dr. Diana Gocheva Gospodinova for her dissertation "The role of medical assistance in determining medical - the biological qualification of bodily injuries".

11/04/2023

Signature:

Associate Professor Dr. Svetlozar Spasov